The Application of the Cooperative Learning Model (Picture and Picture) to Improve the Students' Reading Skill

Yerdiana Mohibu & Hamid Ismail *

*STKIP Kie Raha Ternate, English Education Program
Correspondence: igulholland@gmail.com

Abstract

The purpose of this study was to improve students' reading skills using picture and picture media. This research is a Classroom Action Research. The research was conducted in two cycles. The subjects of this study were 23 students in class IX SMP Kristen Idamgamlamo west Halmahera. The data collection techniques in this study were observation and test. While the data analysis techniques were used The results showed that: The use of picture and picture media can improve students' reading activities. The increase occurred in cycle I is 53,8%. Learning activities were not optimal. The implementation of cycle II is 88,4% causes activity and learning outcomes to be good and increase to a higher level so that it can support quality learning. The conclusion of this research is to improve reading ability by using picture and picture media in class IX SMP Kristen idamgamlamo Halmahera Barat.

Keywords: *picture and picture, cooperative learning, reading comprehension*

© Langua – 2021

1. Background

English is one of the subjects that must be taught in education because it has a very important role in the mastery of science and technology. English is also an international language that is used as a medium of communication to interact with others. In the world of education today English has very important benefits in the learning process such as, can make it easier for us to communicate with others, and can also make us more confident in communicating.

In the current learning process, some teachers still use the lecture method in learning English. so that the process of learning they still often experience obstacles that make students not concentrated, especially in their reading ability, so that in the learning process they are more waiting for the teacher's explanation and they just sit quietly listening to the explanation of the material even material that is not understood by them only through just like that in their minds, so the learning process is still not achieving the expected results. To achieve the expected results, the teacher is required to be active and creative in delivering a material, so

students can be interested and motivated in these learning. Therefore the use of Methods and Pictures in learning English is very necessary for the classroom so that the obstacles faced by students in the learning process can be overcome.

The picture and picture learning model is a model where the teacher uses images to explain a material or facilitate students to actively learn. According to Kurniasih & Sani, (in Handayani, Ganing, and Suniasih, 2017:177) picture and picture learning models are cooperative learning models or prioritize the existence of groups with picture media that are paired or sorted into a logical sequence. While Hamdani (in Widyawati, 2019:229) states that the learning model picture and picture is one form of cooperative learning. This learning model has the characteristics of active, innovative, creative, and fun.

Based on the results of observations and interviews I conducted with one of the English teacher SMP Kristen Idamgamlamo , he said that some of the IX grade students in the school for the use of learning English using the Picture and Picture Method still did not get a place in the hearts of the students. Because students often miss English subject matter and also the lack of active teachers in teaching and learning. Students often assume that English is a subject that is difficult to understand and makes them less interested in these subjects, and also the capture of the material is still lacking towards them so that the constraints they often experience are obstacles in reading. Based on the results of observations and interviews I conducted with one of the English teacher SMP Kristen Idamgamlamo, he said that some of the IX grade students in the school for the use of learning English using the Picture and Picture Method still did not get a place in the hearts of the students because students often miss English subject matter and also the lack of active teachers in teaching and learning. Students often assume that English is a subject that is difficult to understand and makes them less interested in these subjects, and also the capture of the material is still lacking towards them so that the constraints they often experience are obstacles in reading.

2. Theoretical Base

2.1. Cooperative Learning

Cooperative learning is student-centered learning, instructional strategies in the form of instructors that facilitate where there is a small group consisting of several students who are responsible for their learning and their group members. Students interact with each other in the same group to learn and achieve goals. The main theory that underlies cooperative learning is the social theory Kons trucvismm by Vygots in 1986 where he considers that the role of culture, social, language, and interaction is important in understanding how humans learn (in Nisrina, Gunawan, and Harjono, 2016:67). According to Slavin (in Wibisono, Gusniarti, and Nurtjahjo, 2017:3) and Zainurrahman (2021), cooperative learning is a form of learning model that is carried out through the formation of small groups in heterogeneous classes, consisting of four to five students in each group and followed by providing individual assistance for those who need it. While Nurhadi (in Tambak, 2017:3) said the cooperative learning method is a learning method that focuses on the use of small groups of students to work together in maximizing learning conditions to achieve learning goals.

Based on the understanding of cooperative learning, it has been explained above that, in general, the process of teaching and learning is more effective when using these cooperative

learning methods because this cooperative learning method will interact with one another a lot and cooperate more in small groups and have the ability and courage.

2.1.1. Steps in Conducting Cooperative Learning

There are six steps in the cooperative learning model.

1. Conveying students' goals and motivation: the teacher conveys the learning objectives and communicates the basic competencies to be achieved and motivates students.
2. Presentation of information: the teacher provides information to students.
3. Arrange students into study groups: the teacher tells the grouping of students.
4. Guiding study groups: the teacher motivates and facilitates student work in group study groups.
5. Evaluation: the teacher evaluates learning outcomes about the learning material that has been applied.
6. Give awards: the teacher appreciates individual and group learning outcomes.

2.1.2. Picture and Picture Method

The Picture and Picture learning method is a learning model that uses pictures and is paired or sorted into a logical sequence. This learning model relies on images as a medium in the learning process. By using aids or media images, students are expected to be able to follow the lesson with focus and in pleasant conditions. This picture and picture learning model can be used in a variety of subjects and certainly with the creativity of the teacher. since it was popularized around 2002, this learning model began to spread among teachers in Indonesia. By using certain learning models, learning becomes fun. Suprijono (in Widyawati, 2019:229) Picture and Picture is a learning strategy that uses pictures as a learning medium. This strategy is similar to Non-Example Example, where the images given to students must be paired or logically ordered. These images become the main tools in the ongoing learning process. The teacher has prepared a picture that will be displayed either in the form of a large chart. Images can also be displayed via PowerPoint or other software.

2.1.2.1. The Basic Principle of Picture and Picture Method

According to Johnson (in Widyawati, 2019:230) the basic principles in the picture and picture cooperative learning model are as follows:

1. Each group member (student) is responsible for everything that is done in the group.
2. Every group member (student) must know that all group members have the same goal.
3. Each group member (student) must share the same tasks and responsibilities among the group members.
4. Each group member (student) will be subject to evaluation.
5. Each group member (student) shares leadership and needs skills to learn together during the learning process.
6. Each group member (student) will be asked individually to take responsibility for the material handled in the cooperative group.

As the name implies, this type uses image media in the learning process by installing or sorting pictures into a logical sequence. In this way, students are expected to be able to think logically so that learning becomes meaningful.

2.1.2.2. Steps in Implementing Picture and Picture Method

1. Submission of Competencies

At this stage, the teacher is expected to convey the basic competencies of the subjects concerned. Thus, students can measure the extent to which competencies they must master. Also, teachers must convey indicators of achievement of these potentials to measure the level of student success in achieving them.

2. Material Presentation

At the material presentation stage, the teacher has created an initial moment of learning, learning success can start from here. at this stage, the teacher must succeed in giving motivation to some students who might still not be ready.

3. Presentation of Pictures

At this stage, the teacher presents pictures and invites students to be actively involved in the learning process by observing each picture shown. With pictures, teachers will be more energy-efficient, and students will also more easily understand the material being taught. In a further development, the teacher can modify the picture or replace it with a video or demonstration of certain activities.

4. Mounting Pictures

At this stage, the teacher points or calls on students alternately to pair the pictures in sequence and logically. The teacher can also innovate because the direct appointment is sometimes less effective because students tend to feel pressured, one of them is by lottery so that students feel they must be prepared to carry out the given assignment.

5. Scoping

This stage requires the teacher to ask students about the reasons or rationale behind the order of the images they draw.

6. Presentation of basic competencies

Based on the commentary data explanation of the sequence of images, the teacher can start explaining further by the competencies to be achieved. During this process, the teacher must emphasize the achievement of the competencies to be achieved. Here, the teacher can repeat, write or explain the pictures so that students know that the facilities are important in achieving basic competencies and indicators that have been determined.

7. Cover

At the end of the lesson, the teacher and students reflect on each other about what has been achieved and done. This is intended to strengthen the material and competence in students' memories.

2.1.2.3. Advantages and Disadvantages of Picture and Picture Method

Suprijono (In Widyawati, 2019:230) the advantages of the picture and picture learning model are as follows:

1. Advantages:
   a) Students are faster in capturing teaching material because the teacher shows pictures according to the material being studied.
   b) Increase students' thinking power because the teacher asks students to be directly involved.
2. Disadvantages
   a) Difficult to find good and quality pictures that match the material being taught.
   b) Both teachers and students are less accustomed to using pictures as images of the main material in discussing a learning material.The deficiencies in the Picture and picture learning model can be overcome with several attempts. For example, regarding the difficulty, looking for images that match your competence. In this case, the teacher can make their drawings so the teacher can adjust to the material. For a relatively long time, before learning the teacher must have allocated the right time.

2.2. Reading Comprehension

Reading is an activity of pervading, analyzing, and interpreting conducted by the reader to obtain the message to be conveyed by the writer in the written media. Reading is an important activity in everyday life because reading is not only to obtain information but serves as a tool to expand one's language knowledge. According to Tarigan "reading is a process carried out and used by the reader to obtain the message to be conveyed by the writer through the media of words or written language" (In Janurti, Dibia, and Widina, 2016:2). Reading can also be defined as a guiding process so that groups of words that constitute a unity will be seen in a glance and so that the meaning of individual words will be known. Reading is increasingly important because every aspect of life involves reading. For example, there are road signs that can direct people who are traveling to their destination, the titles of books and newspapers are published every day so that people can receive the information conveyed.

Based on some of the opinions above it can be concluded that reading is the process of obtaining meaning from a text, and is used to receive messages and as a communication tool.

2.2.1. The Purpose and Function of Reading

According to the 1994 curriculum the aims of reading are:

1. Able to understand ideas heard directly or indirectly;
2. Able to read reading texts and conclude their contents in their own words;
3. Able to read the reading text quickly and be able to record the main ideas;
4. So the ultimate goal of reading is to understand the idea, the ability to capture meaning in reading as a whole, both in the form of free text, narration, prose or poetry concluded in a written or unwritten work.

The function of reading covers:

Intellectual function: with a lot of reading, we can increase the level of intellect, foster our reasoning power. Example: reading textbooks, scientific papers, research reports, theses, theses, dissertations.

Creativity Booster Function: the results of our reading can encourage, move ourselves to work, supported by a breadth of insight and vocabulary selection. Example: scientific books, literary reading, and others.

Practical Function: reading activities carried out to obtain practical knowledge in life.

Religious Function: reading can be used to foster and enhance faith, expand the mind, and get closer to God.

Informative Function: with a lot of reading readings, the information we get faster. For example: by reading magazines and newspapers we can get a variety of information that is very important or we need in our daily lives.

Recreational Function: reading is used as an effort to entertain the heart, to have an exciting outing. Examples: light reading, novels, humorous stories, variable literary works.

Social Function: reading activities have a high social function when carried out verbally or loudly. Thus the reading activity can be directly utilized by others directing the attitude of saying, acting and thinking. Example: news reading, literary works, announcements.

2.2.2. *Factors that Influence Students' Reading Skill*

Factors that influence reading according to Lamb and Arnol (in Rahim Farida, 2007: 6) there are 3 namely; a. psychological factors, b. intellectual factors, and c. environmental factors. The three opinions can be described as follows:

1. Physiological Factors

Includes physical health, neurological considerations, and gender. Some experts suggest that neurological retardation (for example various brain defects) and lack of physical maturity are among the factors that can cause children to fail in improving their reading comprehension skills.

2. Intellectual Factors

The term intelligence is defined as a thinking activity that is composed of an essential understanding of the given situation and responds appropriately. In general, there is a relationship between intelligence as indicated by IQ and the average increase in remedial reading. The level of reading intelligence itself is essentially the process of thinking and solving problems. Two people with different IQs will certainly have different results and reading abilities.

3. Environmental Factors

Environmental factors influence the progress of students' reading skills.

These environmental factors are:

Background and experience of home children, the environment can shape the child's personality, attitudes, values and language abilities. Conditions at home affect the personal and adjustment of children in society. These conditions can in turn shape children and can prevent children from learning to read. Children who live in a harmonious household, a loving home, will not find significant obstacles in reading. The quality and breadth of the child's experience at home are also important for reading comprehension.

Reading should be a meaningful activity, the children's experience to better understand what they are reading.

4. Socio-economic factors

Socio-economic, parent and neighboring environments are factors that shape the student's home environment. some studies show that the lower the socioeconomic status of students the higher their verbal abilities. children who get good examples of language from adults and parents who speak and encourage their children to talk in support of children's language development and intelligence.

3. Methods

3.1. Research Design

This study used the Classroom Action Research (CAR) method which is a type of research conducted by teachers or researchers to solve learning problems in class. By the purpose of the study, which is to improve the practical quality of a condition that has not been good, this study aimed to apply the Picture And Picture Cooperative Learning Method in Class IX SMP Kristen Idam Gamlamo.

3.2. Population and Sample

This research was conducted at Idam Gamlamo Christian junior School west halmahera while the research time was carried out in odd semester 2019/2020. The research subjects in this activity were grade IX students, totaling 23 students consisting of 10 girls and 13 boys.

3.3. Research Procedure

In this study, the research procedure was based on the CAR model according to Kemmis & Mc Taggrat (in Ani Widayati, 2008:91) that each cycle consists of four stages, namely: 1) Stages, 2) Implementation, 3) Observation, and 4) Reflection.

3.4. Data Collection and Analysis

In general, the notion of a research instrument is a tool used to collect useful data or information to answer research problems. The instruments used in this study were as follows:

1) Observation
   Observation is an activity towards a process or object with the intention of feeling and then understanding the knowledge of a phenomenon based on previously known knowledge and ideas, to obtain the information needed to continue a research.

2) Test

The test is a valuable data measurement tool in research. The test is a set of stimuli (stimuli) that are given to someone with the intention of getting answers which are used as a score.

The minimum completeness criteria (KKM) set in the learning process, namely students are required to meet the minimum completeness set by the school, that is, if it is said to be complete, the minimum completeness criteria score is 65%.

4. Discussion

4.1. Initial Condition (Pre-Research)

This research was conducted at Idamgamlamo Christian Junior High School, Sahu District, West Halmahera Regency on October 9 to 10th, 2020 Before carrying out the research, the researcher first carried out several planning activities including: (1) The researcher held discussions with the teacher and determined the learning plan that would be applied in the classroom as an action in cycle I, (2) Developing a learning implementation plan (RPP) using Picture and picture media in the first cycle, (3) Preparing the tools to be used in learning. The pre-class action research activities began by observing the learning process of English that was taking place in class.

4.2. Data from Cycle I

Cycle I was held in two meetings (2x35 minutes). The first meeting is used for learning activities, while the second meeting is used for tests. The implementation of the first cycle consists of four stages, namely: planning, action, observation and reflection.

a. Planning

In the first cycle the teacher delivered material about folklore. In the planning stage the teacher takes various steps in learning, namely:

1. Formulate goals to be achieved in the learning process;
2. Designing student activity observation sheets;
3. Designing evaluations given to students to measure their success in learning English using the picture and picture model.

b. Action

The teacher opens the lesson by saying greetings, before learning begins the teacher and students first pray together, after that the teacher checks the attendance of students. The teacher conveys the learning objectives of the material and motivates students to learn. The teacher will explain the material to be discussed related to Media Picture and Picture. The teacher divides the students into two groups of 4 to 6 people. Each student must be responsible in their respective groups. The teacher divides the sheets that already contain pictures in each group, after that the students discuss the sheets that have been distributed by the teacher, the teacher also accompanies the students in the discussion. After the discussion is over the teacher asks students to read the results of their discussion in front of the class through the picture media. The teacher asks students to ask questions about material that has not been understood. The teacher evaluates the results of the discussions that have been

presented by each group. After evaluating the material, the teacher gives test questions orally to each group, after that the teacher gives a conclusion about the material and ends with a closing greeting.

c. Observation

In this stage, the activity carried out is observing the teacher's performance in the implementation of learning. Observation activities were carried out by one teacher at Idamgamlamo Christian Middle School At this stage the researchers and collaborators collaboratively held the following activities: (1) Observing the learning techniques that had been carried out, (2) Identifying the constraints and ease factors for researchers in learning using media Picture and picture, (3) Formulating alternative actions to be implemented next.

In the aspect of observing teacher performance, what is observed is the learning, core learning activities, learning media, and so on. Whereas in the aspect of student activity, the students' responses to learning were observed, for example, the activity of asking questions and arguing.

Based on the results of the analysis of the teacher and student worksheets, the following data were obtained:

Table 4.1. Observation Results of Cycle I Students and Teachers

No	Observation	Cycle I average score	Percentage
1	Teacher	35	67%
2	Students	28	53,8%

Based on the data in table 4.1. above, it can be seen that the teacher's activity in cycle I has an average score of 35 and a percentage of 67%. Meanwhile, student activity has an average score of 28 and a percentage of 53,3%. From these results it can be concluded that the teacher's activity has not been maximal and for student activity needs to be increased again in the next cycle.

d. Reflection

This stage is a correction to the actions that have been carried out to determine the advantages and disadvantages that exist in cycle I. The reflection results obtained are as follows:

   1) Lack of confidence to present the results of the discussion

   2) Students are less responsible for discussions

   3) Students lack confidence in expressing opinions

Students are still less active in learning cycle I. Based on the results of the evaluation in cycle I, it was found that student learning outcomes in English subjects were 70 and a percentage of learning outcomes was 65 or only 10 students completed. However, researchers believe that using picture and picture media can improve students' reading ability in English subjects, especially folklore material in grade IX. Researchers will correct any deficiencies in cycle I by making improvements in the next cycle.

4.3. Data from Cycle II

Cycle II is carried out by allocating time for each meeting of 3 x 40 minutes. The activities carried out in the learning process in cycle II which include the planning stage, implementation stage, observation and reflection are described as follows:

a. Planning

The learning process in cycle II, the teacher tries to better master the learning material with the techniques used so that the application runs well and students can follow the learning well. It is hoped that in the implementation of cycle II the learning atmosphere is more enjoyable so that students are more active again.

b. Action

The teacher opens the lesson by saying greetings, before learning begins the teacher and students first pray together, after that the teacher checks the attendance of students. The teacher conveys the learning objectives of the material and motivates students to learn. The teacher will explain the material to be discussed related to Media Picture and Picture. The teacher divides the students into two groups of 4 to 6 people.

Each student must be responsible in their respective groups. The teacher divides the sheets that already contain pictures in each group, after that the students discuss the sheets that have been distributed by the teacher, the teacher also accompanies the students in the discussion. After the discussion is over the teacher asks students to read the results of their discussion in front of the class through the picture media. The teacher asks students to ask questions about material that has not been understood. The teacher evaluates the results of the discussions that have been presented by each group. After evaluating the material, the teacher gives test questions orally to each group, after that the teacher gives conclusions about the material and ends with a closing greeting.

c. Observation

In this stage, the activity carried out is observing the teacher's performance in the implementation of learning. Observation activities were carried out by one teacher at Idamgamlamo Christian Middle School At this stage the researchers and collaborators collaboratively held the following activities: (1) Observing the learning techniques that had been carried out, (2) Identifying the constraints and ease factors for researchers in learning using media Picture and picture, (3) Formulating alternative actions to be implemented next.

In the aspect of observing teacher performance, what is observed is the learning, core learning activities, learning media, and so on. Whereas in the aspect of student activity, the students' responses to learning were observed, for example, the activity of asking questions and arguing.

Based on the results of the analysis of the teacher and student worksheets, the following data were obtained:

Table 4.3. Observation Results of Students and Teachers in Cycle II

No	Observation	Cycle I average score	Presentase
1	Teacher	51	98%
2	Students	28	88,4%

Based on the results of observations made during the learning process, the results obtained in cycle II have reached the specified success indicators. The success of the teacher actually carried out according to the improvement plan on the reflection results of cycle I. the implementation of the reading practice test on the results of cycle II after two meetings were held.

5. Conclusion

Based on the results of the action research carried out in two cycles, and based on all the discussions and analysis carried out, it can be concluded that the picture and picture media can improve the reading skills of grade IX students of SMP Kristen Idamgamlamo. The average value of students 'reading skills in the first cycle obtained a value of 53,8% and was included in the good category, the results obtained were still not optimal so that continued to cycle II, in cycle II the average value of students' reading skills increased to 88,4% and is included in the very good category, therefore, this research can be said to be successful which has been fulfilled in cycle II.

References

Fauziah, T., & Bermawi, Y. (2014) Penerapan Model Kooperatif Tipe Picture And Picture Pada Materi Sejarah Disekolah Dasar Negeri Banda Aceh. *Journal Pesona Dasar, Vol.2, No.3, p.87*

Handayani, D. N. M., Ganing, N. N., & Suniasih, W. N. (2017). Model Pembelajaran Picture and Picture Berbantuan Media Audio-Visual Terhadap Kompetensi Pengetahuan IPA. *Journal Education of Technology, Vol.1, No. 3, pp.176-182*

Harsono, A. S. R.,& Fuady, A., & Saddhono, K.(2012) Pengaruh Strategi Know Want To Learn(KWL) Dan Minat Membaca Terhadap Kemampuan Membaca Intesif Siswa SMP Negeri Temanggung. *Jurnal Penelitian Bahasa, vol.1, No.1, pp.53-64*

Irdawati, Y. & Darmawan (2017) Meningkatkan Kemampuan Membaca Permulaan Dengan Menggunakan Media Gambar di Kelass 1 Di Min Buol. *Journal Kreatif Tadulako Online, vol.5,No.4, pp.1-14*

Janurti, N.K., Dibia, K,. Widiana, W. (2016) Analisis Kesulitan Belajar Dalam Pembelajaran Membaca Cepat Siswa Kelas V SD Gugus VI Kecamatan Abang. *Journal PGSD Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Vol.4, No.1, pp.1-10*

Mar'ah, N. A. (2016*). Meningkatkan Kemampuan Membaca Nyaring Pada Mata Pelajaran Bahasa Indonesia Melalui Penerapan Cooperative Learning di Kelas II SDN Inpres Sidoharjo Kecamatan Moilong Kabupaten Banggai. *Jurnal Kreatif Tadulako, 4(12)*

Nisrina., Gunawan., Harjono, A.(2016) Pembelajaran Kooperatif dengan Media Virtual Untuk Peningkatan Penguasaan Konsep Fluida Statis Siswa. *Jurnal Pendidikan Fisika dan Teknologi, vol.2, No.2, pp.66-72*

Rahman, B, & Haryanto.(2014) Peningkatan Keterampilan Membaca Permulaan Melalui Media Flashcard Pada Siswa Kelas 1 SDN Bajayau Tengah 2. *Journal Prima Edukasia, Vol.2, pp.134-136*

Samniah, N. (2016) Kemampuan Memahami Isi bacaan Siswa Kelas VII MTs Swasta Labibia. *Journal Humanika, Vol.1, No.16, pp.1-16*

Suryani, N, L.(2019) Pengaruh Lingkungan Kerja Non Fisik Dan Komunikasi Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan pada PT. Bangkit Maju Bersama Di Jakarta. *Jurnal Ilmiah, Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia, Vol.2, No.3, p.423*

Tambak,S.(2017) Metode Cooperative Learning dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam. *Jurnal Al-Hikmah, vol.14, No.1, pp.1-17*

Wayan, S., W.(20013) Profil Penilaian Belajar Siswa Berdasarkan Kurikulum 2013. *Jurnal Pembelajaran Vol.5, No.1, pp.39-54*

Wibisono,S., Gusniarti., Nurtjahjo, F. E.(2017) Pembelajaran Kooperatif Sebagai Upaya Meningkatkan Motivasi, Empati Dan Perilaku Bekerjasama. *Journal of psychological Research,Vol.3, No.1, pp.1-10*

Widayati,A (2008) Penelitian Tindak Kelas. *Jurnal Pendidikan Akuntansi Indonesia, Vol.6, No.1, pp.87-91*

Widyawati, W. Y. (2019) Keefektifan Model Pembelajaran Picture and Picture Dalam ketrampilan Menulis Untuk Tingkat Univesitas. *Jurnal Kredo,Vol.2, No.3, pp.226-241*

Zainurrahman, Z. (2021). The Structure of Peer Feedback. *LANGUA: Journal of Linguistics, Literature, and Language Education*, *4*(1), 14-34. https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.4643017

Electronic Sources:

http://fatkhan.web.id/pengertian-dan-langkah-langkah-model-pembelajaran-picture-picture/.10
http://www.wahadika.or.id/berita/detail/tujuan-dan-fungsi-membaca.
https://faizalnizbah.blogspot.com/2013/06/faktor-faktor-yang-mempengaruhi.html?m=1
https://www.zonareferensi.com/pengertian-instrumen-penelitian/
https://www.porosilmu.com/2015/04/prosedur-penelitian-tindakan-kelas-ptk.html
http://belajarpendidikanpkn.blogspot.com/2017/03/pengertian-penerapan-dan-unsur-unsur.html?m=1
https://www.coursehero.com/file/p187/teknik-pengumpulan-data.